



# House of Commons

Thursday 19 March 2020

## PUBLIC BILL COMMITTEE PROCEEDINGS

---

### ENVIRONMENT BILL

[FIRST TO SEVENTH SITTINGS]

---

#### GLOSSARY

*This document shows the fate of each clause, schedule, amendment and new clause.*

*The following terms are used:*

*Agreed to:* agreed without a vote.

*Agreed to on division:* agreed following a vote.

*Negatived:* rejected without a vote.

*Negatived on division:* rejected following a vote.

*Not called:* debated in a group of amendments, but not put to a decision.

*Not moved:* not debated or put to a decision.

*Question proposed:* debate underway but not concluded.

*Withdrawn after debate:* moved and debated but then withdrawn, so not put to a decision.

*Not selected:* not chosen for debate by the Chair.

---

#### FIRST AND SECOND SITTINGS

Leo Docherty

*Agreed to*

That—

- (1) the Committee shall (in addition to its first meeting at 9.25am on Tuesday 10 March) meet—
  - (a) at 2.00pm on Tuesday 10 March;
  - (b) at 11.30am and 2.00pm on Thursday 12 March;
  - (c) at 9.25am and 2.00pm on Tuesday 17 March;
  - (d) at 11.30am and 2.00pm on Thursday 19 March;
  - (e) at 9.25am and 2.00pm on Tuesday 24 March;
  - (f) at 11.30am and 2.00pm on Thursday 26 March;
  - (g) at 9.25am and 2.00pm on Tuesday 31 March;

**Environment Bill, continued**

- (h) at 4.00pm and 7.00pm on Tuesday 21 April;
  - (i) at 11.30am and 2.00pm on Thursday 23 April;
  - (j) at 9.25am and 2.00pm on Tuesday 28 April;
  - (k) at 11.30am and 2.00pm on Thursday 30 April;
  - (l) at 9.25am and 2.00pm on Tuesday 5 May;
- (2) the Committee shall hear oral evidence in accordance with the following Table:

**TABLE**

<i>Date</i>	<i>Time</i>	<i>Witness</i>
Tuesday 10 March	Until no later than 10.30am	Aldersgate Group; Broadway Initiative
Tuesday 10 March	Until no later than 11.25 am	Food and Drink Federation; Federation of Small Businesses; Veolia
Tuesday 10 March	Until no later than 2.30 pm	Local Government Association
Tuesday 10 March	Until no later than 3.30 pm	Natural England; Wildlife Trusts; Country Land and Business Association; NFU
Tuesday 10 March	Until no later than 4.00 pm	National Federation of Builders
Tuesday 10 March	Until no later than 5.00 pm	Greener UK; Greenpeace; Royal Society for the Protection of Birds
Thursday 12 March	Until no later than 12.15 pm	Asthma UK and British Lung Foundation; UNICEF; Air Quality Expert Group; ClientEarth
Thursday 12 March	Until no later than 1.00 pm	Water UK; Blueprint for Water; Marine Conservation Society
Thursday 12 March	Until no later than 2.45 pm	George Monbiot; Wildlife and Environment Link
Thursday 12 March	Until no later than 3.15 pm	Keep Britain Tidy; Green Alliance
Thursday 12 March	Until no later than 4.00 pm	Chem Trust; Chemical Industries Association; Unite
Thursday 12 March	Until no later than 5.00 pm	Scottish Environment LINK; Environmental Protection Scotland; Law Society Scotland

- (3) proceedings on consideration of the Bill in Committee shall be taken in the following order: Clauses 1 to 21; Schedule 1; Clauses 22 to 45; Schedule 2; Clause 46; Schedule 3; Clause 47; Schedule 4; Clause 48; Schedule 5; Clause

**Environment Bill**, *continued*

49; Schedule 6; Clause 50; Schedule 7; Clause 51; Schedule 8; Clause 52; Schedule 9; Clauses 53 to 63; Schedule 10; Clauses 64 to 69; Schedule 11; Clause 70; Schedule 12; Clauses 71 to 78; Schedule 13; Clauses 79 to 90; Schedule 14; Clauses 91 to 100; Schedule 15; Clauses 101 to 115; Schedule 16; Clauses 116 to 122; Schedule 17; Clauses 123 and 124; Schedule 18; Clause 125; Schedule 19; Clauses 126 to 133; new Clauses; new Schedules; remaining proceedings on the Bill;

- (4) the proceedings shall (so far as not previously concluded) be brought to a conclusion at 5.00 pm on Tuesday 5 May.

---

Leo Docherty

That, at this and any subsequent meeting at which oral evidence is to be heard, the Committee shall sit in private until the witnesses are admitted.

*Agreed to*

---

Leo Docherty

That, subject to the discretion of the Chair, any written evidence received by the Committee shall be reported to the House for publication.

*Agreed to*

---

*The following witnesses gave oral evidence:*

*Signe Norberg, Public Affairs Manager, Aldersgate Group; Edward Lockhart-Mummery, Project Convenor and Principal Investigator, and Martin Baxter, Chief Policy Advisor, Broadway Initiative.*

*David Bellamy, Senior Environment Policy Manager, Food and Drink Federation; Andrew Poole, Deputy Head of Policy, Federation of Small Businesses; and Martin Curtois, External Affairs Director, Veolia.*

*Mayor Philip Glanville, Mayor of Hackney, Local Government Association.*

*Dr Diane Mitchell, Chief Environment Adviser, NFU; Alan Law, Deputy Chief Executive, Natural England; Dr Sue Young, Head of Land Use Planning and Ecological Networks, Wildlife Trusts; and Judicaelle Hammond, Director of Policy, Country Land and Business Association.*

*Rico Wojtulewicz, Head of Housing and Planning Policy, House Builders Association (HBA).*

*Ruth Chambers, Senior Parliamentary Affairs Associate, Greener UK; Rebecca Newsom, Head of Politics, Greenpeace UK; and Ali Plummer, Senior Policy Officer, Royal Society for the Protection of Birds*

---

**THIRD AND FOURTH SITTINGS**

*The following witnesses gave oral evidence:*

*Sarah MacFadyen, Head of Policy, Asthma UK and British Lung Foundation Partnership; Liam Sollis, Head of Policy, UNICEF UK; Katie Nield, UK Clean Air Lawyer, ClientEarth; and Professor Alastair Lewis, Chair, Air Quality Expert Group*

*Stuart Colville, Director of Strategy, Water UK; Ian Hepburn, Chair, Blueprint for Water; and*

**Environment Bill**, *continued*

*Chris Tuckett, Director of Programmes, Marine Conservation Society*  
*George Monbiot, Journalist and Environmental Campaigner; and Dr Richard Benwell, CEO, Wildlife and Environment Link*  
*Libby Peake, Head of Resources, Green Alliance; and Richard McIlwain, Deputy Chief Executive, Keep Britain Tidy*  
*Dr Michael Warhurst, Executive Director, Chem Trust; Bud Hudspith, National H&S Adviser, Unite; and Nishma Patel, Policy Director, Chemical Industries Association*  
*Lloyd Austin, LINK Honorary Fellow and convener of LINK's Governance Group, Scottish Environment LINK; Alison McNab, Policy Executive, Law Society of Scotland; John Bynorth, Policy and Communications Officer, Environmental Protection Scotland*

**FIFTH AND SIXTH SITTINGS**

Dr Alan Whitehead  
 Luke Pollard  
 Ruth Jones  
 Daniel Zeichner  
 Jessica Morden  
 Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire

Alex Sobel

*Withdrawn after debate* 79

Clause 1, page 1, line 7, leave out “may” and insert “must”

Neil Parish  
 Alex Sobel  
 Philip Dunne

*Withdrawn after debate* 103

Clause 1, page 1, line 10, at end insert—

- “(1A) The Secretary of State must exercise the power in subsection (1) with the aim of establishing a coherent framework of targets he or she considers would, if met:
- (a) make a significant contribution towards the environmental objectives, and
  - (b) ensure continuous improvement of the environment as a whole.
- (1B) Where the Secretary of State considers that a target is necessary but the means of expressing the target is not yet sufficiently developed, he or she must explain the steps being taken to develop an appropriate target.”

Dr Alan Whitehead  
 Luke Pollard  
 Ruth Jones  
 Daniel Zeichner  
 Thangam Debbonaire  
 Abena Oppong-Asare

Jessica Morden

Alex Sobel

*Withdrawn after debate* 1

Clause 1, page 1, line 11, leave out subsection (2) and insert—

- “(2) The Secretary of State must exercise the power in subsection (1) so as to set the appropriate long-term targets within each priority area for the purpose of achieving and maintaining a healthy environment on land and at sea”.

---

**Environment Bill, continued**

Kerry McCarthy  
Alex Sobel

*Withdrawn after debate* 76

Clause 1, page 1, line 17, at end insert—  
“(e) global footprint.”

Dr Matthew Offord

*Not selected* 106

Clause 1, page 1, line 17, at end insert—  
“(3A) Targets set within the priority area of waste and resources must include matters relating to the reduction of overall material use and waste generation and pollution including, but not limited to, plastics.”

Dr Alan Whitehead  
Luke Pollard  
Ruth Jones  
Daniel Zeichner  
Jessica Morden  
Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire

*Negated on division* 178

Clause 1, page 1, line 17, at end insert—  
“(3A) Targets set within the priority area of air quality must include targets for—  
(a) the ambient 24 hour mean concentration of PM2.5 and PM10;  
(b) average human exposure to PM2.5 and PM10; and  
(c) annual emissions of NO<sub>x</sub>, ammonia, PM2.5, PM10, SO<sub>2</sub> and non-methane volatile organic compounds.  
(3B) Targets set within the priority area of water must include, but are not limited to, matters relating to—  
(a) abstraction rates; and  
(b) the chemical and biological status and monitoring of inland freshwater and the marine environment.  
(3C) Targets set within the priority area of biodiversity must include, but are not limited to, matters relating to—  
(a) the abundance, diversity and extinction risk of species; and  
(b) the quality, extent and connectivity of habitats.  
(3D) Targets set within the priority area of waste and resources must include, but are not limited to, matters relating to the reduction of overall material use and waste generation and pollution, including but not limited to plastics.”

Dr Alan Whitehead  
Luke Pollard  
Ruth Jones  
Daniel Zeichner  
Jessica Morden  
Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire

Alex Sobel

*Withdrawn after debate* 80

Clause 1, page 2, line 4, at end insert—  
“(4A) A target under this section must be set on the basis of the best available evidence and any advice given under section (3)(1).”

---

**Environment Bill, *continued***

- (4B) In setting targets under this section, the Secretary of State must take into account relevant international best practices and seek to improve on them.”

Rebecca Pow

Clause 1, page 2, line 15, leave out “the National Assembly for Wales” and insert “Senedd Cymru” *Agreed to* 28

Rebecca Pow

Clause 1, page 2, line 16, leave out “Assembly” and insert “Senedd” *Agreed to* 29

Kerry McCarthy

Clause 1, page 2, line 16, at end insert— *Not called* 77  
 “(10) Without prejudice to subsection (6), the global footprint target is required to be met with regard to ecosystem conversion and degradation, and to deforestation and forest degradation, by 31 December 2020.”

*Clause, as amended, agreed to.*

---

Neil Parish  
 Andrew Selous  
 Tracey Crouch  
 Steve Brine  
 Sir Peter Bottomley  
 Peter Aldous

Derek Thomas  
 Geraint Davies  
 Philip Dunne  
 Luke Pollard  
 Jessica Morden  
 Alex Sobel

Rob Roberts  
 Sir Robert Neill  
 Caroline Nokes  
 Ruth Jones  
 Abena Oppong-Asare

David Warburton  
 Anne Marie Morris  
 Dr Alan Whitehead  
 Daniel Zeichner  
 Thangam Debbonaire

Clause 2, page 2, line 20, leave out subsection (2) and insert— *Negativated on division* 23  
 “(2) The PM2.5 air quality target must—  
 (a) be less than or equal to 10µg/m3;  
 (b) have an attainment deadline on or before 1 January 2030.”

Dr Alan Whitehead  
 Luke Pollard  
 Ruth Jones  
 Daniel Zeichner  
 Jessica Morden  
 Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire

Clause 2, page 2, line 20, leave out subsection (2) and insert— *Not called* 185  
 “(2) The PM2.5 air quality target must—

**Environment Bill, continued**

- (a) follow World Health Organisation guidelines and;
- (b) have an attainment deadline on or before 1 January 2030.”

*Clause agreed to.*

Dr Alan Whitehead  
 Luke Pollard  
 Ruth Jones  
 Daniel Zeichner  
 Jessica Morden  
 Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire

Alex Sobel

*Withdrawn after debate* **81**

Clause 3, page 2, line 33, leave out subsection (1) and insert—

- “(1) Before making regulations under sections 1 or 2, reviewing targets under section 6, setting interim targets under section 10, or considering actions required to achieve targets set under sections 1, 2, or 10, the Secretary of State must—
- (a) obtain, and take into account, the advice of a relevant independent and expert advisory body set up for this purpose;
  - (b) carry out full public consultation;
  - (c) publish that advice as soon as is reasonably practicable.
- (1A) If regulations laid under sections 1 or 2 or interim targets make provision different from that recommended by the advisory body, the Secretary of State must both publish the public interest reasons for those differences and make a statement to Parliament on them.
- (1B) Any advisory body set up under subsection (1)(a) must comprise 50 per cent of members nominated by the OEP and 50 per cent of members nominated by the Committee on Climate Change.”

Dr Alan Whitehead  
 Luke Pollard  
 Ruth Jones  
 Daniel Zeichner  
 Jessica Morden  
 Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire

*Not called* **181**

Clause 3, page 2, line 35, at end insert—

- “(1A) The advice sought under section 3(1) must include advice on how the scope and level of targets should be set to significantly improve the natural environment and minimise, or where possible eliminate, the harmful impacts of pollution on human health and the environment.”

Neil Parish  
 Geraint Davies  
 Alex Sobel

*Withdrawn after debate* **24**

Clause 3, page 3, line 20, leave out “31 October 2022” and insert “31 December 2020”

---

**Environment Bill, *continued***

*Clause agreed to.*

---

Dr Alan Whitehead  
 Luke Pollard  
 Ruth Jones  
 Daniel Zeichner  
 Jessica Morden  
 Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire                      Alex Sobel

*Withdrawn after debate*    **82**

Clause 4, page 3, line 24, at end insert “and,  
 (c) interim targets are met.”

Dr Alan Whitehead  
 Luke Pollard  
 Ruth Jones  
 Daniel Zeichner  
 Jessica Morden  
 Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire                      Alex Sobel

*Withdrawn after debate*    **83**

Clause 4, page 3, line 24, at end insert “and,  
 (c) steps identified under section 5(5)(b) are taken.”

*Clause agreed to.*

---

Dr Alan Whitehead  
 Luke Pollard  
 Ruth Jones  
 Daniel Zeichner  
 Jessica Morden  
 Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire                      Alex Sobel

*Withdrawn after debate*    **84**

Clause 5, page 4, line 1, at end insert—  
 “(c) include a timetable for adoption, implementation and review of the  
 chosen measures, and the authorities responsible for their delivery, and  
 (d) an analysis of the options considered and their estimated impact on  
 delivering progress against the relevant targets.”

*Clause agreed to.*

---



**Environment Bill**, *continued*

Neil Parish  
Geraint Davies  
Sir Robert Neill  
Anne Marie Morris  
Alex Sobel

*Not called* 25

Clause 6, page 4, line 21, after “England” insert—  
“and minimise, or where possible eliminate, the harmful impacts of air pollution on human health and the environment as quickly as possible”

Dr Alan Whitehead  
Luke Pollard  
Ruth Jones  
Daniel Zeichner  
Jessica Morden  
Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire                      Alex Sobel

*Not called* 85

Clause 6, page 4, line 21, at the end insert “on land, and at sea.”

Dr Alan Whitehead  
Luke Pollard  
Ruth Jones  
Daniel Zeichner  
Jessica Morden  
Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire

*Withdrawn after debate* 183

Clause 6, page 4, line 21, at end insert—  
“(3A) In considering whether the natural environment would be significantly improved, the Secretary of State must be satisfied that—  
(a) the terrestrial and marine natural environment in England has improved as a system; and  
(b) that the achievement of any targets which meet the conditions specified in subsection (8) would constitute significant improvement in that matter.”

Neil Parish  
Geraint Davies  
Alex Sobel

*Not called* 26

Clause 6, page 4, line 29, after “2023” insert—  
“or, in the case of the PM2.5 air quality target and any other long-term and interim target set within the air quality priority area, within 6 months of publication of updated guidelines on ambient air pollution by the World Health Organization, whichever is earlier”

Neil Parish  
Geraint Davies  
Alex Sobel

*Not called* 27

Clause 6, page 4, line 31, after “completed” insert—

**Environment Bill**, *continued*

“or, in the case of the PM2.5 air quality target and any other long-term and interim target set within the air quality priority area, within 6 months of publication of updated guidelines on ambient air pollution by the World Health Organization, whichever is earlier”

Dr Alan Whitehead  
Luke Pollard  
Ruth Jones  
Daniel Zeichner  
Jessica Morden  
Abena Oppong-Asare

Thangam Debbonaire

Alex Sobel

*Withdrawn after debate* 86

Clause 6, page 4, line 41, at end insert—

- “(9) In carrying out a review under this section, the Secretary of State must consider whether any targets relating to the priority areas in section 1 that are contained in legislation which forms part of the law of England and Wales—
- (a) have expired, or
  - (b) are required to be achieved by a date which has passed.
- (10) If paragraph (a) or (b) applies, then the significant environmental improvement test is only met if a new target or targets are set relating to the same matters which specify a new standard and a future date by which such standards must be reached.”

*Clause agreed to.*

---

*SEVENTH SITTING*

Rebecca Pow

To move, That, notwithstanding the Committee’s order of 10 March, the Committee, at the conclusion of proceedings at the sitting starting at 11.30am on 19 March, do adjourn to a time and date to be fixed by the Chair.

*Agreed to*