



House of Commons
Justice Committee

Appointment of the Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission

Third Report of Session 2016–17



House of Commons
Justice Committee

Appointment of the Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission

Third Report of Session 2016–17

*Report, together with formal minutes
relating to the report*

*Ordered by the House of Commons to be printed
13 July 2016*

Justice Committee

The Justice Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the expenditure, administration and policy of the Ministry of Justice and its associated public bodies (including the work of staff provided for the administrative work of courts and tribunals, but excluding consideration of individual cases and appointments, and excluding the work of the Scotland and Wales Offices and of the Advocate General for Scotland); and administration and expenditure of the Attorney General's Office, the Treasury Solicitor's Department, the Crown Prosecution Service and the Serious Fraud Office (but excluding individual cases and appointments and advice given within government by Law Officers).

Current membership

[Robert Neill MP](#) (*Conservative, Bromley and Chislehurst*) (Chair)

[Richard Arkless MP](#) (*Scottish National Party, Dumfries and Galloway*)

[Alex Chalk MP](#) (*Conservative, Cheltenham*)

[Alberto Costa MP](#) (*Conservative, South Leicestershire*)

[Philip Davies MP](#) (*Conservative, Shipley*)

[Chris Elmore MP](#) (*Labour, Ogmore*)

[Mr David Hanson MP](#) (*Labour, Delyn*)

[John Howell MP](#) (*Conservative, Henley*)

[Dr Rupa Huq MP](#) (*Labour, Ealing Central and Acton*)

[Victoria Prentis MP](#) (*Conservative, Banbury*)

[Marie Rimmer MP](#) (*Labour, St Helens South and Whiston*)

The following Members were also members of the Committee during the Parliament:

[Richard Burgon MP](#) (*Labour, Leeds East*), [Sue Hayman MP](#) (*Labour, Workington*), [Andy McDonald MP](#) (*Labour, Middlesbrough*), [Christina Rees MP](#) (*Labour, Neath*), and [Nick Thomas-Symonds MP](#) (*Labour, Torfaen*).

Powers

The Committee is one of the departmental select committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No 152. These are available on the internet via www.parliament.uk.

Publication

Committee reports are published on the Committee's website at www.parliament.uk/justicecttee and in print by Order of the House.

Evidence relating to this report is published on the [inquiry publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

Committee staff

The current staff of the Committee are Nick Walker (Clerk), Jonathan Whiffing (Second Clerk), Gemma Buckland (Senior Committee Specialist), Nony Ardill (Legal Specialist), Christine Randall (Senior Committee Assistant), Anna Browning (Committee Assistant), and Liz Parratt (Committee Media Officer).

Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Justice Committee, House of Commons, London SW1A 0AA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 8196; the Committee's email address is justicecom@parliament.uk.

Contents

Report	3
Background	3
The Judicial Appointments Commission	3
The role of the Chair of the JAC	3
Person specification	4
The recruitment process	4
Lord Kakkar, the preferred candidate	5
Appendix A: Posts which are subject to pre-appointment hearings before the Justice Committee	7
Appendix B: Correspondence between the Secretary of State and the Chair	8
Appendix C: Person specification included in candidates pack	16
Appendix D: Curriculum vitae supplied to the selection panel – Lord Kakkar	17
Appendix E: Corrected curriculum vitae – Lord Kakkar	24
Appendix F: Conflicts of Interest and previous conduct – Lord Kakkar	28
Formal Minutes	29
Witness	30
List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament	31

Report

Background

1. The Judicial Appointments Commission (JAC) was created on 3 April 2006, under the provisions of the Constitutional Reform Act 2005. The JAC is a Non-Departmental Public Body, sponsored by the Ministry of Justice. Its remit is to recommend for appointment candidates for judicial office in courts and tribunals in England and Wales, and for some tribunals with a UK wide jurisdiction.¹ The Lord Chancellor has three options when he receives a recommendation: he may accept the selected person; reject that person and require a different name to be put forward or require the Commission to reconsider its selection.² The grounds under which the Lord Chancellor may not accept a recommendation are limited and he must give his reasons in writing.³

The Judicial Appointments Commission

2. The JAC's statutory duties require it to:

- select candidates only on merit;
- select only people of good character; and
- to have regard to the need to encourage diversity in the range of persons available for judicial selection.⁴

In cases where the JAC judges candidates to be equal after having regard to their experience, qualifications and expertise, the JAC may prefer the candidate who will increase diversity within the judiciary.⁵ According to the JAC's equal merit provision policy, it currently only considers race and gender for this purpose.⁶

The role of the Chair of the JAC

3. According to the Ministry of Justice the role of the Chair will be to:

- Uphold the principles of judicial independence and the recruitment of judges on merit on the basis of fair and open competition;
- Lead, manage, motivate, and appraise the Commissioners, monitoring the implementation and effectiveness of the Commission's strategy and priorities, and develop an effective partnership with the Chief Executive to ensure that the Commission delivers these priorities;
- Make strong and constructive working relationships with the judiciary, the Lord Chancellor, Parliament, senior civil servants, the legal profession and other key stakeholders;

1 Constitutional Reform Act 2005, [Schedule 14](#)

2 Constitutional Reform Act 2005, [Section 90](#)

3 Ibid, [section 91](#)

4 Constitutional Reform Act 2005, [Sections 63-64](#)

5 Section 63, [Constitutional Reform Act 2005](#), as amended

6 Judicial Appointments Commission, [Equal Merit Provision JAC Policy](#), para 6

- Join selection panels for the most senior and/or sensitive appointments alongside other Commissioners;
- Be the public face of the Commission, promoting and acting as an ambassador for its work and the rule of law; playing a leading role with partners in securing a more diverse judiciary;
- Work with the Ministry both to appoint individual Commissioners and to ensure that each is fully inducted and appraised.

Person specification

4. The Chair must be a lay member; a person resident in England or Wales who has never held any judicial office; cannot have ever been a practising lawyer; and cannot be employed in the civil service.

5. The following constituted essential criteria for the role:

- Integrity;
- Recognition of the importance of the judiciary, its constitutional position and independence and that of the JAC;
- A commitment to recruitment on merit on the basis of fair and open competition, working with the Lord Chief Justice and the Lord Chancellor as each discharges their statutory duty to encourage judicial diversity;
- The ability to chair Boards and effectively handle the relationship between Board and the Executive; and
- A senior leader with exceptional strategic skills to guide the Commission through challenges, providing proportionate and practical solutions which withstand public scrutiny.⁷

The following criteria, though not essential, were considered desirable:

- A track record of chairing senior level nominations/appointments processes.
- Experience of dealing effectively with the media, strong communication skills and a personal style that demonstrates authority and trust;
- Understanding or knowledge of working within a Government context;
- Financial experience or experience of working within significant budgetary constraints to deliver value for money.⁸

The recruitment process

6. In October 2015 the Secretary of State for Justice, Rt Hon Michael Gove MP consulted us on the recruitment process for the appointment of the Chair of the Judicial Appointment Commission. It was originally expected that a pre-appointment hearing

⁷ Appendix C

⁸ Ibid

would take place in February of this year. In a letter dated 9 February Mr Gove informed us that he was going to rerun the competition, as it “regrettably, produced a relatively limited field.” In order to make the post more attractive, the Secretary of State explained that he had reduced the time commitment from 3 to 2 days a week and increased the remuneration. The post was advertised on the Cabinet Office website and Korn Ferry conducted an executive search. The members of the selection panel were:

- Baroness Eliza Manningham-Buller as panel chair;
- The Rt Hon The Lord Thomas of Cwmgiedd, Lord Chief Justice for England and Wales;
- Lord Paul Bew, Chair of the Committee on Standards in Public Life.

Correspondence between the Chair and the Secretary of State on the recruitment process is attached as Appendix B.

7. The Ministry informed us that there were 28 applicants for the role, of whom 19 were men, 9 were women and one candidate declared himself to be from a Black Minority Ethnic (BME) background. No candidate declared themselves as having a disability. 17 candidates progressed to pre-interviews with the recruitment consultants and the short-list stage. Of those 17 candidates, 15 were men and 2 were women and one candidate was from a BME background. Eight candidates, all men, one of whom was from a BME background were called to interview by the selection panel. Three candidates were judged appointable, all of whom were men and one was from a BME background.

Lord Kakkar, the preferred candidate

8. In a letter dated 5 July 2016, the Secretary of State informed us his preferred candidate for the Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission was Rt Hon Lord Kakkar, who has held a range of senior positions in the health sector. The Secretary of State’s letter had annexed to it Lord Kakkar’s *curriculum vitae*, as seen by the selection panel. The candidate, through the Ministry, later informed us that the original c.v. put in front of the selection board was one collated by the recruitment agency and had not been agreed or signed off by him. On Friday 8 July, the Ministry sent us a corrected c.v. which had been agreed by the candidate.

9. At the hearing, Lord Kakkar explained that he had no problem with the veracity of the content of the c.v. provided to the selection panel but he disagreed with the presentation of some information. For example he believed that some of the degrees listed under education, specifically ones that had been conferred upon him either by resolution or election, should not properly have been included alongside degrees earned via examination in the “education” section. He also believed that some of the positions listed in the original c.v. were not particularly relevant to the position in question.⁹ Both documents are attached as Appendices D and E. His declaration of interests and previous conduct form is attached as Appendix F.

10. We asked Lord Kakkar a range of questions on matters including the relevance of his expertise and experience to the post of Chair of the JAC, his priorities for the Commission and his experience in managing budgets, and his views on diversity within the judiciary. We found his answers to be carefully considered and measured.

11. We agree with the selection board that Lord Kakkar meets the criteria for the position of Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission and is appointable. We wish him well in the role. Once Lord Kakkar has had some time to grow accustomed to the role, we would like to hold a further evidence session with him to hear his first impressions of the Judicial Appointments Commission and any challenges it is likely to face. We also wish to take the opportunity to place on record our thanks to the outgoing Chair, Christopher Stephens, for his excellent service in the position over the last five years.

Appendix A: Posts which are subject to pre-appointment hearings before the Justice Committee

Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission

Chair of the Office of Legal Complaints

HM Chief Inspector of the Crown Prosecution Service

HM Chief Inspector of Prisons

HM Chief Inspector of Probation

Prisons and Probation Ombudsman

Appendix B: Correspondence between the Secretary of State and the Chair

Letter from Rt Hon Michael Gove MP, Secretary of State for Justice, to Bob Neill MP, Chair of the Justice Committee, dated 1 October 2015

As you know, I am responsible for the recruitment of the Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission (JAC) an appointment that is subject to pre-appointment scrutiny. I am writing to seek your views on our plans to recruit a replacement for Christopher Stephens, who is to complete his term as Chair of the JAC 8 April 2016; his appointment having been extended by two months to cover the final stages of this recruitment competition.

The Chair of the JAC is a Royal appointment subject to the Constitutional Reform Act 2005 and the Judicial Appointments Commission Regulations 2013. The legislation provides that the members of the Commission, including the Chair, shall be appointed by Her Majesty on the recommendation of the Lord Chancellor. This appointment is regulated by the Commissioner for Public Appointments.

The JAC, comprising the Chair and fourteen Commissioners, was established to maintain, and strengthen, judicial independence by taking responsibility for selecting candidates for judicial office and making the appointments process clearer and more accountable to the public. Its role is to select candidates for judicial office on merit, through fair and open competition, from the widest range of eligible candidates.

The proposed job description and criteria are described in the attached annex.

The selection panel for this competition is:

- Baroness Eliza Manningham-Buller as panel chair;
- The Rt Hon The Lord Thomas of Cwmgiedd, Lord Chief Justice for England and Wales;
- Sir Philip Dilley, Chair of the Environment Agency.

The post will be advertised on the Sunday Times and the Cabinet Office websites, and recruitment consultants will carry out executive search.

The indicative dates for the competition are;

- Advertising and search: **October - November**
- Sifts and pre-interviews: **November - December**
- Interviews: **January**
- Select Committee pre-appointment hearing - **February**
- Induction and security clearance: **March**
- Appointment starts: **April 2016**

The adverts and candidate information packs for the competition will make clear that applications are particularly welcome from women, black minority ethnicity, those with a disability and from those that have not previously held a public appointment.

I would be grateful if I could receive your views by 20 October.

The proposed job description will read as follows:

Applications are sought for the role of Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission (JAC). The JAC, now in its 10th year, is an independent commission that selects candidates for judicial office in courts and tribunals in England and Wales, and for some tribunals whose jurisdiction extends to Scotland or Northern Ireland. It selects candidates for judicial office on merit, through fair and open competition, from the widest range of eligible candidates.

The Chair of the JAC must be a lay person appointed after interview by an independent panel which includes the Lord Chief Justice. The post holder chairs the selection panel for the appointment of the Lord Chief Justice of England and Wales and the President of the Supreme Court, and is a member of selection panels for other senior judicial posts. The role also involves chairing monthly meetings of the Commission Board, which discusses issues of good governance in relation to the JAC and matters of policy, as well as bi-monthly meetings of the Selection and Character Committee, which makes decisions relating to the recommendation of several hundred candidates for judicial appointment each year.

The role is both important and challenging. It requires the ability to work effectively with judges, Ministers, senior officials and members of the legal profession; oversee high quality appointment processes, and a commitment to upholding the principle of judicial independence.

The Chair will be expected to:

- Uphold the principles of judicial independence and the recruitment of judges on merits on the basis of fair and open competition;
- Lead, manage, motivate, and appraise the Commissioners, monitoring the implementation and effectiveness of the Commission's strategy and priorities, and develop an effective partnership with the Chief Executive to ensure that the Commission delivers these priorities;
- Make strong and constructive working relationships with the judiciary, the Lord Chancellor, Parliament, senior civil servants, the legal profession and other key stakeholders;
- Join selection panels for the most senior and/or sensitive appointments alongside other Commissioners;
- Be the public face of the Commission, promoting and acting as an ambassador for its work and the rule of law; playing a leading role in cooperation with the Lord Chief Justice and Lord Chancellor and other partners in securing a more diverse judiciary;
- Work with the Ministry both to appoint individual Commissioners and to ensure that each is fully inducted and appraised.

The eligibility requirements are:

- The Chair must be a lay member; a person resident in England or Wales who has never held any judicial office; can not have ever been a practising lawyer; and can not be employed in the Civil Service of the State.

The proposed essential criteria are:

- Integrity;
- Recognition of the Importance of the judiciary, its constitutional position and independence and that of the JAC;
- A commitment to recruitment on merit on the basis of fair and open competition, working with the Lord Chief Justice and the Lord Chancellor as each discharges their statutory duty to encourage judicial diversity;
- The ability to chair Boards and effectively handle the relationship between Board and the Executive;
- A senior leader with strong strategic skills to sustain effective relationships and guide the Commission through challenges, providing proportionate and practical solutions which withstand public scrutiny;
- Substantial and up-to-date understanding and/or experience of making senior appointments.

The proposed desirable criteria are:

- Experience of dealing effectively with the media, strong communication skills and a personal style that demonstrates authority and trust;
- Understanding or knowledge of working within a Government context;
- Financial experience or experience of working within significant budgetary constraints to deliver value for money.

Letter from Bob Neill MP, Chair of the Justice Committee, to Rt Hon Michael Gove MP, Secretary of State for Justice, dated 14 October 2015

Thank you for your letter of 1 October consulting us on the proposed arrangements for the forthcoming recruitment of the Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission. My Committee has no comments to make at this stage.

I would be grateful if, as ever, your appointments team would keep in touch with our Committee staff concerning progress of the competition, in particular in relation to a prospective date for us to hold a pre-appointment scrutiny hearing.

Letter from Rt Hon Michael Gove MP, Secretary of State for Justice, to Bob Neill MP, Chair of the Justice Committee, dated 9 February 2016

I am writing to inform you that after careful consideration I have decided to re-advertise the recruitment competition for the post of Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission. It is vital that there is a strong pool of candidates for the role from which to select. The recruitment, regrettably, produced a relatively limited field.

I have conveyed my views to the selection panel who support this decision.

In line with normal practice, my officials will contact you with details of the new recruitment competition once these are finalised.

Letter from Rt Hon Michael Gove MP, Secretary of State for Justice, to Bob Neill MP, Chair of the Justice Committee, dated 17 March 2016

I am responsible for the recruitment of the Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission (JAC) an appointment that is subject to pre-appointment scrutiny. Further to my letter of 9 February in which I informed you that I will be re-running the recruitment, I am now seeking your views on the process.

The Chair of the JAC is a Royal appointment subject to the Constitutional Reform Act 2005 and the Judicial Appointments Commission Regulations 2013. The legislation provides that the members of the Commission, including the Chair, shall be appointed by Her Majesty on the recommendation of the Lord Chancellor. This appointment is regulated by the Commissioner for Public Appointments.

The advertisement and candidate information pack for the competition will make clear that applications are particularly welcome from women, black minority ethnicity, those with a disability and from those that have not previously held a public appointment.

The post will be advertised on the Cabinet Office website, and recruitment consultants will carry out executive search. Details of the recruitment competition are attached with this letter.

I would be grateful if I could receive your views by Tuesday 22 March.

The proposed job description will read as follows:

Applications are sought for the role of Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission (JAC). The JAC, now in its 10th year, is an independent commission that selects candidates for judicial office in courts and tribunals in England and Wales, and for some tribunals whose jurisdiction extends to Scotland or Northern Ireland. It selects candidates for judicial office on merit, through fair and open competition, from the widest range of eligible candidates.

The Chair of the JAC must be a lay person appointed after interview by an independent panel which includes the Lord Chief Justice. The post holder chairs the selection panel for the appointment of the Lord Chief Justice of England and Wales and the President of the Supreme Court, and is a member of selection panels for other senior judicial posts. The role also involves chairing monthly meetings of the Commission Board, which discusses

issues of good governance in relation to the JAC and matters of policy, as well as bi-monthly meetings of the Selection and Character Committee, which makes decisions relating to the recommendation of several hundred candidates for judicial appointment each year.

The role is both important and challenging. It requires the ability to work effectively with judges, Ministers, senior officials and members of the legal profession, oversee high quality appointment processes, and a commitment to upholding the principle of judicial independence.

The Chair will be expected to:

- Uphold the principles of judicial independence and the recruitment of judges on merit on the basis of fair and open competition;
- Lead, manage, motivate, and appraise the Commissioners, monitoring the implementation and effectiveness of the Commission's strategy and priorities, and develop an effective partnership with the Chief Executive to ensure that the Commission delivers these priorities;
- Make strong and constructive working relationships with the judiciary, the Lord Chancellor, Parliament, senior civil servants, the legal profession and other key stakeholders;
- Join selection panels for the most senior and/or sensitive appointments alongside other Commissioners;
- Be the public face of the Commission, promoting and acting as an ambassador for its work and the rule of law; playing a leading role with partners in securing a more diverse judiciary;
- Work with the Ministry both to appoint individual Commissioners and to ensure that each is fully inducted and appraised.

The eligibility requirements are:

- The Chair must be a lay member; a person resident in England or Wales who has never held any judicial office; cannot have ever been a practising lawyer; and cannot be employed in the Civil Service of the State.

The proposed essential criteria are:

- Integrity;
- Recognition of the importance of the judiciary, its constitutional position and independence and that of the JAC;
- A commitment to recruitment on merit on the basis of fair and open competition;
- The ability to chair Boards and effectively handle the relationship between Board and the Executive;

- A senior leader with strong strategic skills to sustain effective relationships and guide the Commission through challenges, providing proportionate and practical solutions which withstand public scrutiny;
- Substantial and up-to-date understanding and/or experience of making senior appointments.

The proposed desirable criteria are:

- Experience of dealing effectively with the media, strong communication skills and a personal style that demonstrates authority and trust;
- Understanding or knowledge of working within a Government context;
- Financial experience or experience of working within significant budgetary constraints to deliver value for money.

The new proposed selection panel following the departure of Sir Philip Dilley and indicative timetable are:

The selection panel for this competition is now:

- Baroness Eliza Manningham-Buller as panel chair;
- The Rt Hon The Lord Thomas of Cwmgiedd, Lord Chief Justice for England and Wales;
- Lord Paul Bew, Chair of the Committee on Standards in Public Life.

The indicative timetable for the competition is;

- Advertising and search: **March - April**
- Sifts and pre-interviews: **April - May**
- Interviews: **late May**
- Select Committee pre-appointment hearing - **July**
- Induction and security clearance: August - **September**
- Appointment starts: **September**

Letter from Bob Neill MP, Chair of the Justice Committee, to Rt Hon Michael Gove MP, Secretary of State for Justice, dated 22 March 2016

Thank you for your letters of 17 March consulting us on the proposed arrangements for the forthcoming recruitment of the Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission and the Prisons and Probation Ombudsman.

We are concerned by the unreasonably short amount of time you have asked for our reply within. This has meant that we have not had an opportunity to examine this in depth and we therefore reserve the right to follow up this letter with any further concerns we have in future. We understand you will probably wish to proceed with the advertisements for the posts despite this. Please bear in mind in future that we usually meet as a Committee

once a week when the House is sitting; if we are being consulted on matters such as this we need to receive documents in good time for circulation by our staff and you need to take account of the fact that after discussion we may wish to seek clarification of certain points before responding.

In relation to the recruitment of the Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission, you previously informed us that you were re-running the competition because the recruitment “produced a relatively limited field.” It would be helpful if you would provide more information about how this will be rectified.

In relation to the Prisons and Probation Ombudsman post, we would be grateful to receive further information from you about why you are considering the role to be a three to four day per week appointment. What benefits do you think this will bring to the post and specifically what kinds of applicants you think will be more attracted towards a part-time post? We also believe the timetable is somewhat leisurely. We would be willing to hold a pre-appointment hearing in September instead of October, if that would help.

In the previous Justice Committee’s Fourteenth Report of Session 2014-15, *Appointment of HM Chief Inspector of Prisons: matters of concern*, the Committee stated it was concerned about the fact that two out of four members of the appointments board were active members of the Conservative Party, a fact that had not been disclosed to the Committee. We further note the concerns raised by the Commissioner for Public Appointments, annexed to that report, in which he undertook to revise the code in relation to panel members who are active members of political parties. For the appointment of the Prisons and Probation Ombudsman, we note that Lizzie Noel is on the board not as an independent member but in her capacity as a non-executive director of the Ministry of Justice, and we also note that Jeremy Browne is on the board as an independent member. At this stage we have no comment to offer on this but we reserve the possibility of coming back to the matter at a future date.

In our Third Report of Session 2015-16 *Appointment of HM Chief Inspector of Prisons and HM Chief Inspector of Probation*, we raised concerns about aspects of the appointments process and you told us you had noted those concerns. Please bear in mind that at pre-appointment scrutiny hearings we will be likely to ask the preferred candidates for the Chair of the JAC and the PPO about whether there has been any repetition of the circumstances that gave rise to those concerns.

Letter from Rt Hon Michael Gove MP, Secretary of State for Justice, to Bob Neill MP, Chair of the Justice Committee, dated 12 April 2016

Thank you for your letter, dated 22 March, concerning my plans to recruit a Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission (JAC) and a Prisons and Probation Ombudsman (PPO); both of which are subject to pre-appointment scrutiny. I have noted your remarks regarding both competitions and apologise for the short timeframe in which I requested a reply. Your speedy response was very much appreciated.

There has been a number of changes since the JAC Chair’s position was last advertised. Having further reflected on the expectations of the role, and in discussion with the JAC and the Lord Chief Justice, I have reduced the time commitment to two days a week. I have also increased the daily rate of remuneration so it is now more commensurate to the

importance of the position. I believe these changes will make the role a more attractive and help us find high-calibre candidates. I have also commissioned the recruitment consultants Korn Ferry to carry out an executive search. They have an excellent reputation and significant reach into sectors which are likely to produce a strong and diverse range of candidates.

You also sought clarification on the terms on which the PPO appointment is being advertised. The role is advertised as a full-time post but with the option of reducing the commitment to three or four days a week. The position is not exclusively advertised as a part-time post. Instead, the possibility of some flexibility in terms of the time commitment required is offered. I believe that this will increase the field of applicants and encourage greater diversity.

Thank you for your offer of an earlier pre-appointment hearing - my officials will aim to provide you with details of the preferred candidate in late August to meet the September meeting deadline.

Letter from Rt Hon Michael Gove MP, Secretary of State for Justice, to Bob Neill MP, Chair of the Justice Committee, dated 5 July 2016

I am responsible for the appointment of the Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission (JAC) - a role that is subject to pre-appointment scrutiny by the Justice Select Committee. I am pleased to formally put forward my preferred candidate for the Committee's consideration, Lord Kakkar.

Lord Kakkar is Professor of Surgery at University College London and as Chairman has been a key figure in the establishment of UCL Partners (an academic health science partnership with over 40 higher education and NHS members). He is one of the UK's leading clinical academics and a global authority on thrombosis research.

In 2010 he became a Cross-Bench Peer and has held the role of Chairman of the House of Lords Appointments Commission (HOLAC) since 2013. He is also a member of the General Medical Council, as well as being a UK Business Ambassador for Healthcare and Life Science.

I can confirm that all candidates were informed that this position is subject to scrutiny by the Justice Select Committee and Lord Kakkar has been informed of the arrangements that have been made for the Committee to consider his appointment on Tuesday 12 July.

The recruitment campaign followed the process described in my earlier letter to you. The criteria for the competition and details of the selection panel are set out in the attached annex. A copy of Lord Kakkar's conflict of interest, CV, candidate information pack and the advert are also attached.

I look forward to receiving the outcome of the Committee's deliberations and I shall consider carefully the committee's conclusions before deciding whether to proceed with the appointment.

Appendix C: Person specification included in candidates pack

Essential criteria

- Integrity;
- Recognition of the importance of the judiciary, its constitutional position and independence and that of the JAC;
- A commitment to recruitment on merit on the basis of fair and open competition, working with the Lord Chief Justice and the Lord Chancellor as each discharges their statutory duty to encourage judicial diversity;
- The ability to chair Boards and effectively handle the relationship between Board and the Executive;
- A senior leader with exceptional strategic skills to guide the Commission through challenges, providing proportionate and practical solutions which withstand public scrutiny.

Desirable criteria

- A track record of chairing senior level nominations/appointments processes.
- Experience of dealing effectively with the media, strong communication skills and a personal style that demonstrates authority and trust;
- Understanding or knowledge of working within a Government context;
- Financial experience or experience of working within significant budgetary constraints to deliver value for money.

Appendix D: Curriculum vitae supplied to the selection panel – Lord Kakkar

Education

2014	FRCP (London) <i>Verification Pending</i>
2014	University of Oxford MA <i>Verification Pending</i>
1998	FRCP (Gen) Intercollegiate Board in General Surgery <i>Verification Pending</i>
1998	University of London PhD <i>Verification Pending</i>
1988	University of London MBBS (Hons), Distinction in Surgery <i>Verification Pending</i>
1985	University of London BSc, Medical Science & Pharmacology <i>Verification Pending</i>

Current non-executive positions

2011 to Present

University College London

2014 to Present

Chairman, UCLPartners

- UCLPartners is an academic health science partnership with over 40 higher education and NHS members along with a central team providing operational support and clinical academic leadership through a not-for-profit company. Together, the member organisations form one of the world's leading centres of medical discovery, healthcare innovation and education.

2011 to Present

Professor of Surgery

2007 to Present

University College London Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust

Consultant Surgeon

2008 to Present

Thrombosis Research Institute

Director

2015 to Present

UK India CEO Forum

Member

2015 to Present

Commonwealth Healthcare Business Group

Chairman

2015 to Present

Commonwealth Secretariat

Member of Commonwealth Health Exchange Advisory Board (CWEIC)

2015 to Present

Supervisory Board of the Kuwait British Business Centre (Commonwealth Enterprise & Investment Council)

Member

2014 to Present

Privy Council

Her Majesty's Most Honourable Member

2014 to Present

Harris Manchester College, University of Oxford

Member, Governing Board

2014 to Present

King Edward VII Hospital

Trustee and Governor

2014 to Present

UAE-UK Business Council

Member

2013 to Present

UK Business Ambassador for Healthcare and Lifesciences

2013 to Present

House of Lords Appointments Commission (HOLAC)

Chairman

2013 to Present
Health Honours Committee, Cabinet Office UK
Chairman

2012 to Present
Royal Hospital Chelsea
Commissioner

2012 to Present
General Medical Council (GMC)

2012 to Present
Member, Remuneration Committee
2014 to 2015

Member, Investment Sub-Committee

2012 to 2014
Member, Expert Advisory Group – Shape of Training Review

2011 to Present
Capricorn Foundation
Trustee

2012 to Present
Westminster Health Forum
Patron

2012 to Present
Power International
Vice Patron

2011 to Present
All Party Parliamentary Group on Medical Research
Vice-Chair

2011 to Present
All Party Parliamentary Group on Global Health
Treasurer

Previous non-executive positions

2013 to 2015
ResPublica ‘British Civic Life Advisory Panel’
Member

2012 to 2014

House of Lords

Treasurer, Campaign for an Effective Second Chamber

2011 to 2013

Indo-British All Party Parliamentary Group

Vice-Chairman

2011 to 2013

All Party Parliamentary Group on Dalits

Treasurer

2011 to 2012

Associate Parliamentary Group on Surgical Services

Co-Chairman

2010 to 2013

University College London Partners Staff College

Patron

2010 to 2013

The London Pathway

Trustee

2008 to 2015

Association of Surgeons of Great Britain and Ireland (ASGBI)

2012 to 2015

Director, External Affairs

2008 to 2012

Member, Executive Board and Council

2008 to 2013

The Dulwich Estate, London, UK

Trustee

2007 to Present

North American Thrombosis Forum, International Advisory Board (NATF)

Member

2007 to 2010

UK India Joint Economic and Trade Committee (JETCO) Healthcare Group

Member

2007 to 2010

National Cancer Research Institute (NCRI)

Member, Breast Clinical Studies Group

2007 to 2009

Department of Health

Member, Implementation Working Group (IWG) on Venous Thromboembolism

2004 to 2009

St Bartholomew's Hospital

Consultant Surgeon

2003 to 2012

International Union of Angiology (IUA)

Co-Chairman, International Consensus Guideline on Venous Thromboembolism

2001 to 2008

Thrombosis Research Institute (TRI)

Trustee

2001 to 2013

International Symposia on Thromboembolism (IST)

Chairman, Organising Committee

2000 to 2015

Alleyn's School Governing Board

2013 to 2015

Chairman, W J Smith Trust

2008 to 2015

Chairman

2006 to 2008

Chairman, Strategy Committee

Selected executive / clinical career details

2004 to 2011

Barts and The London School of Medicine and Dentistry, London, UK

2005 to 2011

Dean for External Relations

2004 to 2011

Consultant Surgeon & Professor of Surgical Sciences

- Also held a range of appointments within Queen Mary, University of London, including serving as a Member of the Warden's Strategic Advisory Group; a

Member of the School of Medicine and Dentistry Executive Team, a Member of the Academic Health Sciences Centre Implementation Group and a Member of the SMD/BLT Joint Clinical Research Board.

2004 to 2008

Centre Lead, Centre for Surgical Sciences, Institute of Cancer

1999 to 2004

Hammersmith Hospital and Imperial College, London, UK

Senior Lecturer and Consultant Surgeon

1998 to 1999

Hammersmith Hospital

Senior Registrar, General and HPB Surgery

1997 to 1998

Ealing Hospital

Senior Registrar, General, Upper GI and Laparoscopic Surgery

1995 to 1999

Hammersmith Hospital

1995 to 1999

Senior Registrar, Surgery

1995 to 1997

Senior Registrar, General, Endocrine, Breast Surgery and HPB Surgery

1995 to 1996

Senior Registrar, General and HPB Surgery

1992 to 1995

Registrar, Surgery

1996 to 2000

Royal Postgraduate Medical School

MRC Clinician Scientist Fellow

1991 to 1992

Royal Sussex County Hospital, Brighton

Senior House Officer, General and Vascular Surgery

1990 to 1991

Hammersmith Hospital

Senior House Officer, General and HPB Surgery

1990 to 1990

St. Mary's Hospital

Senior House Officer, Accident and Emergency

1988 to 1989

King's College Hospital

1989 to 1989

House Surgeon

1988 to 1989

House Physician

Appendix E: Corrected curriculum vitae – Lord Kakkar

Education

1998	University of London (Imperial College) PhD
1992	Royal College of Surgeons (England) FRCS
1988	University of London (King's College) MBBS (Hons), Distinction in Surgery
1985	University of London (King's College) BSc, Medical Science & Pharmacology

Current positions

2011 to Present

University College London

2014 to Present

Chairman, UCLPartners

- UCLPartners is an academic health science partnership with over 40 higher education and NHS members along with a central team providing operational support and clinical academic leadership through a not-for-profit company. Together, the member organisations form one of the world's leading centres of medical discovery, healthcare innovation and education.

2011 to Present

Professor of Surgery

2007 to Present

University College London Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust

Consultant Surgeon

2008 to Present

Thrombosis Research Institute

Director

2014 to Present

Privy Council

Her Majesty's Most Honourable Member

2014 to Present
Harris Manchester College, University of Oxford
Member, Governing Board

2014 to Present
King Edward VII Hospital
Trustee and Governor

2014 to Present
UAE-UK Business Council
Member

2013 to Present
UK Business Ambassador for Healthcare and Lifesciences

2013 to Present
House of Lords Appointments Commission (HOLAC)
Chairman

2013 to Present
Health Honours Committee, Cabinet Office UK
Chairman

2012 to Present
Royal Hospital Chelsea
Commissioner

2012 to Present
General Medical Council (GMC)
Member

Previous appointments

2008 to 2015
Association of Surgeons of Great Britain and Ireland (ASGBI)
2012 to 2015
Director, External Affairs
2008 to 2012
Member, Executive Board and Council

2008 to 2013
The Dulwich Estate, London, UK
Trustee

2000 to 2015

Alley's School Governing Board

2008 to 2015

Chairman

Selected clinical career details

2004 to 2011

Barts and The London School of Medicine and Dentistry, London, UK

2005 to 2011

Dean for External Relations

2004 to 2011

Consultant Surgeon & Professor of Surgical Sciences

1999 to 2004

Hammersmith Hospital and Imperial College, London, UK

Senior Lecturer and Consultant Surgeon

1998 to 1999

Hammersmith Hospital

Senior Registrar, General and HPB Surgery

1997 to 1998

Ealing Hospital

Senior Registrar, General, Upper GI and Laparoscopic Surgery

1992 to 1999

Hammersmith Hospital

Higher surgical training

1996 to 2000

Royal Postgraduate Medical School

MRC Clinician Scientist Fellow

1991 to 1992

Royal Sussex County Hospital, Brighton

Senior House Officer, General and Vascular Surgery

1990 to 1991

Hammersmith Hospital

Senior House Officer, General and HPB Surgery

1990 to 1990

St. Mary's Hospital

Senior House Officer, Accident and Emergency

1988 to 1989

King's College Hospital

1989 to 1989

House Surgeon

1988 to 1989

House Physician

Formal Minutes

Wednesday 13 July 2016

Members present:

Robert Neill, in the Chair

Richard Arkless	John Howell
Alex Chalk	Dr Rupa Huq
Alberto Costa	Victoria Prentis
Mr David Hanson	

Draft Report (*Appointment of the Chair of the Judicial Appointments Commission*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read the first time.

Ordered, That the draft Report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph.

Paragraphs 1 to 11 read and agreed to.

Several papers were appended to the Report as Appendices A to F.

Resolved, That the Report be the Third Report of the Committee to the House.

Ordered, That the Chair make the Report to the House.

Ordered, That embargoed copies of the Report be made available, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order No. 134.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 19 July at 11.15am]

Witness

The following witness gave evidence. The transcript can be viewed on the inquiry publications page of the Committee's website.

Wednesday 12 July 2016

Question number

Rt Hon. Lord Kakkar

[Q1-54](#)

List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament

All publications from the Committee are available on the [publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

The reference number of the Government's response to each Report is printed in brackets after the HC printing number.

Session 2016–17

First Report	Reduction in sentence for a guilty plea guideline	HC 168
Second Report	Courts and tribunals fees	HC 167

Session 2015–16

First Report	Draft Allocation Guideline	HC 404
Second Report	Criminal courts charge	HC 586 (HC 667)
Third Report	Appointment of HM Chief Inspector of Prisons and HM Chief Inspector of Probation	HC 624
Fourth Report	Criminal Justice inspectorates	HC 724 (HC 1000)
Fifth Report	Draft sentencing guideline on community and custodial sentences	HC 876
Sixth Report	Prison Safety	HC 625
First Special Report	Women offenders: follow-up: Government response to the Committee's Thirteenth Report of Session 2014–15	HC 374