



House of Commons
Public Administration
and Constitutional Affairs
Committee

**Appointment of the
First Civil Service
Commissioner**

Fourth Report of Session 2016–17

*Report, together with formal minutes
relating to the report*

*Ordered by the House of Commons to be printed
6 September 2016*

Public Administration and Constitutional Affairs

The Public Administration and Constitutional Affairs Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the reports of the Parliamentary Commissioner for Administration and the Health Service Commissioner for England, which are laid before this House, and matters in connection therewith; to consider matters relating to the quality and standards of administration provided by civil service departments, and other matters relating to the civil service; and to consider constitutional affairs.

Current membership

[Mr Bernard Jenkin MP](#) (*Conservative, Harwich and North Essex*) (*Chair*)

[Ronnie Cowan MP](#) (*Scottish National Party, Inverclyde*)

[Oliver Dowden MP](#) (*Conservative, Hertsmere*)

[Paul Flynn MP](#) (*Labour, Newport West*)

[Mrs Cheryl Gillan MP](#) (*Conservative, Chesham and Amersham*)

[Kate Hoey MP](#) (*Labour, Vauxhall*)

[Kelvin Hopkins MP](#) (*Labour, Luton North*)

[Mr David Jones MP](#) (*Conservative, Clwyd West*)

[Gerald Jones MP](#) (*Labour, Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney*)

[Tom Tugendhat MP](#) (*Conservative, Tonbridge and Malling*)

[Mr Andrew Turner MP](#) (*Conservative, Isle of Wight*)

Powers

The Committee is one of the departmental select committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No. 146. These are available on the internet via www.parliament.uk.

Publication

Committee reports are published on the Committee's website at www.parliament.uk/pacac and in print by Order of the House.

Evidence relating to this report is published on the [inquiry publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

Committee staff

The current staff of the Committee are: Dr Rebecca Davies (Clerk), Ms Rhiannon Hollis (Clerk), Dr Adam Evans (Committee Specialist), Dr Henry Midgley (Committee Specialist), Ms Penny McLean (Committee Specialist), Rebecca Usden (Committee Specialist), Ana Ferreira (Senior Committee Assistant), Iwona Hankin (Committee Assistant), and Mr Alex Paterson (Media Officer).

Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Public Administration and Constitutional Affairs Committee, House of Commons, London SW1A 0AA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 3268, the Committee's email address is pacac@parliament.uk.

Contents

1	Appointment of the First Civil Service Commissioner	3
	The First Civil Service Commissioner	3
	Recruitment Process	3
	Role and criteria	3
	Essential criteria	4
	Ineligibility	4
	Mr Watmore, the Government's preferred candidate	5
	Appendix 1: PACAC Briefing FCSC Appointment	6
	Appendix 2: First Civil Service Commissioner Information Pack	7
	Appendix 3: CV Ian Watmore	12
	Formal Minutes	14
	Witness	15
	List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament	16

1 Appointment of the First Civil Service Commissioner

The First Civil Service Commissioner

1. The Civil Service Commission was established in 1855 as a consequence of the Northcote Trevelyan report. The Commission's powers were revised several times across the late 19th and 20th centuries.¹ The Commission's current role was set out in the Constitutional Reform and Governance Act 2010. According to the Act,

- The Commission receives and adjudicates on complaints from civil servants about breaches of the civil service code.²
- The Commission is responsible for upholding the principle that appointments within the civil service are made upon merit.³
- The Commission and the Minister for the Civil Service may agree that the Commission may carry out additional functions as well as those described above.⁴

2. From 2011 to 2016, Sir David Normington served as First Civil Service Commissioner. Sir David also served during the same time period as Public Appointments Commissioner. The Government decided to split the roles again in 2016 and have appointed Peter Riddell as the new Public Appointments Commissioner. PACAC endorsed this appointment on 14th April 2016.⁵

Recruitment Process

3. On 31 August 2016, the Cabinet Office formally notified the Committee that they had selected Ian Watmore as the preferred candidate.

4. Ian Watmore was recruited through an open competition. The recruitment panel consisted of Sir Nicholas Macpherson, then Permanent Secretary at the Treasury, Sir Jeremy Heywood, Cabinet Secretary and Amy Stirling, non-executive director at the Cabinet Office and the independent panel member. According to information submitted to us by the Cabinet Office, seventeen applications were received by the panel.⁶

Role and criteria

5. According to the Cabinet Office interview pack, the main responsibilities of the First Civil Service Commissioner are to

- “be the public face of the Commission;

1 Civil Service Commission [History of the Commission](#)

2 [Constitutional Reform and Governance Act 2010](#) Section 9

3 [Constitutional Reform and Governance Act 2010](#) Section 10-14

4 [Constitutional Reform and Governance Act 2010](#) Section 17

5 Public Administration and Constitutional Affairs Committee [Appointment of the Public Appointments Commissioner](#) HC 869 (April 2016)

6 Appendix 1: PACAC Briefing FCSC Appointment

- provide leadership – personal and professional – to the Commission, leading its policy development and regulatory decision-making;
- uphold the values of the Civil Service – honesty, integrity, objectivity and impartiality – and the principles of selection on merit on the basis of fair and open competition;
- personally chair the most senior competitions; and
- take an active part in the Senior Leadership Committee chaired by the Cabinet Secretary and Head of the Civil Service, which manages the movement and development of the most senior staff within the Civil Service.”⁷

Essential criteria

6. According to the Cabinet Office, the successful candidate will have
- “excellent judgement and the ability to assimilate a range of evidence and perspectives;
 - strong communication skills;
 - the ability to demonstrate authority and command trust and confidence at all levels;
 - experience of selecting individuals at a senior level in the private, public or voluntary sectors; and
 - the ability to lead and work within a diverse team of influential people.

In addition, the successful candidate will be able to demonstrate an understanding of the role of the Civil Service.”⁸

7. The Cabinet Office also state that “because of the Commission’s role in upholding the Civil Service values, Civil Service Commissioners are required to be - and be seen to be - independent, objective and free from political or other influence.”⁹

Ineligibility

8. The Cabinet Office have also said that “serving civil servants will not be appointed as the First Civil Service Commissioner. Under the terms of the House of Commons Disqualification Act 1975, the European Assembly Elections Act 1978, the Scottish Parliament (Disqualification) Order 2003 and the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2003, MPs, MEPs, MSPs and members of the National Assembly for Wales are disqualified from holding the office of Civil Service Commissioner.”¹⁰

7 Appendix 2: First Civil Service Commissioner Information Pack
8 Appendix 2: First Civil Service Commissioner Information Pack
9 Appendix 2: First Civil Service Commissioner Information Pack
10 Appendix 2: First Civil Service Commissioner Information Pack

Mr Watmore, the Government's preferred candidate

9. Mr Watmore, the government's preferred candidate, has had a long and distinguished career in business, the civil service and public life. He served as UK Managing Director for Accenture between 2000 and 2004. He was Permanent Secretary at the Department for Universities, Innovation and Skills between 2007 and 2009 and at the Cabinet Office in 2012. He also led the Football Association from 2009 to 2010. Mr Watmore has additionally taken a number of posts on Boards, including as a Church Commissioner, a non-executive Director at the Office of the Information Commissioner and Chair of the Trustees at the Migraine Trust.¹¹

10. The Committee asked Mr Watmore about his vision for the role. Mr Watmore told us he would have succeeded in his role if

in five years' time the civil service as a whole will have moved on [...] It will still have protected Northcote-Trevelyan and all that flows with that. It will be moving into a more diverse leadership at the top, more women at the top, for example, and a greater pipeline of women coming through, to use that as an example. We will have a greater breadth of skills at the top [...] We will be looking back and saying we got the right resources moved around in the system to help the country face its perhaps biggest challenge in modern times, which is how to move through the [exiting the European Union] agenda.¹²

Mr Watmore made clear his enthusiasm for working with the Committee and taking account of its priorities. The Committee also asked Mr Watmore about whether he would be sufficiently independent to take on the role. Mr Watmore told us that he was

not constrained in my mind by a model that says, "This is how the civil service works and all we can do is polish and improve it".¹³

He also gave us examples of when he had demonstrated his independence of mind.¹⁴

11. PACAC confirms Mr Watmore's appointment as First Civil Service Commissioner. PACAC is undertaking inquiries into the civil service and its governance and we will, through this work, scrutinize the work of the Commissioner and how he and the Government uphold the values of the civil service, to ensure it is fit for purpose. In particular, the future capability of the civil service depends upon the leadership capability of the senior civil service and we are pleased that Mr Watmore looks forward to working with PACAC on this and all other matters relating to the civil service.¹⁵ PACAC will also continue to support and scrutinise the Civil Service Commission and its independence.

11 Appendix 3: CV Ian Watmore

12 Q36 Oral Evidence 6.9.2016

13 Q40 Oral Evidence 6.9.2016

14 Q40 Oral Evidence 6.9.2016

15 Qq 34, 64 Oral Evidence 6.9.2016

Appendix 1: PACAC Briefing FCSC Appointment

Summary

The First Civil Service Commissioner is appointed by the Queen for a five-year non-renewable term of office.

At the end of 2015, the Cabinet Office ran an open competition for the post of First Civil Service Commissioner. Previously a single postholder – David Normington - held both this position and the role of Commissioner for Public Appointments. When David's term of office came to an end, the decision was taken to decouple these two posts and revert to the position of two separate appointments pre-2010.

The Cabinet Secretary, Sir Jeremy Heywood chaired the selection panel and was accompanied by the then Permanent Secretary at HM Treasury, Nick Macpherson and Amy Stirling (independent panel member and non-executive director of the Cabinet Office Board).

The panel sought candidates with excellent judgement, strong communication skills, the ability to lead a diverse group of people, demonstrate authority and command trust at all levels, and experience of recruitment to senior posts.

A total of 17 applications were received and considered by the panel. Of these, three were shortlisted for interview.

Of the three candidates interviewed (two men and one woman), two were deemed appointable but with the panel advising that overall Ian Watmore was considered to be the strongest candidate.

The Prime Minister is content with the recommendation. Following consultation, the First Ministers in Scotland and Wales confirmed they had no objection to the appointment. The leader of the Official Opposition was also consulted, and no comments were received.

Appendix 2: First Civil Service Commissioner Information Pack

The Civil Service Commission

The Commission is a high profile body whose work can attract considerable public and media interest. It is independent of the Government and of the Civil Service.

Civil Service Commissioners were first appointed in 1855 following the Northcote-Trevelyan report, which identified patronage as one of the main reasons for the inefficiency of the mid-19th century Civil Service. Since 2010, the Commission has existed as an independent executive Non-Departmental Public Body with its powers and responsibilities confirmed in the Constitutional Reform and Governance Act.

The Commission:

- chairs recruitment competitions for the most senior-level appointments in the Civil Service;
- supports government departments in promoting the Civil Service values of impartiality, objectivity, honesty and integrity;
- adjudicates on complaints (about recruitment and about breaching the Civil Service standards); and
- sets standards for recruitment into the Civil Service.

The Commission is made up of a Board of Civil Service Commissioners (currently 11 including the First Commissioner) and it is supported by a secretariat led by the Commission's Chief Executive. The Commissioners bring a range of experience of the private, public and voluntary sectors, and an independent perspective to ensure a high performing Civil Service is well placed to meet the challenges of the future.

Further information about the Commission's work can be found at:

<http://civilservicecommission.independent.gov.uk>

The role of the First Civil Service Commissioner

The main responsibilities of the First Commissioner are to:

- be the public face of the Commission;
- provide leadership – personal and professional – to the Commission, leading its policy development and regulatory decision-making;
- uphold the values of the Civil Service – honesty, integrity, objectivity and impartiality – and the principles of selection on merit on the basis of fair and open competition;
- personally chair the most senior competitions; and

- take an active part in the Senior Leadership Committee chaired by the Cabinet Secretary and Head of the Civil Service, which manages the movement and development of the most senior staff within the Civil Service.

Skills and experience required

Essential Criteria

The successful candidate will have:

- excellent judgement and the ability to assimilate a range of evidence and perspectives;
- strong communication skills;
- the ability to demonstrate authority and command trust and confidence at all levels;
- experience of selecting individuals at a senior level in the private, public or voluntary sectors; and
- the ability to lead and work within a diverse team of influential people.

In addition, the successful candidate will be able to demonstrate an understanding of the role of the Civil Service.

Ineligibility

Serving civil servants will not be appointed as the First Civil Service Commissioner. Under the terms of the House of Commons Disqualification Act 1975, the European Assembly Elections Act 1978, the Scottish Parliament (Disqualification) Order 2003 and the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2003, MPs, MEPs, MSPs and members of the National Assembly for Wales are disqualified from holding the office of Civil Service Commissioner.

Because of the Commission's role in upholding the Civil Service values, Civil Service Commissioners are required to be - and be seen to be - independent, objective and free from political or other influence. Applicants will therefore need to declare any possible conflict of interest that they may have as a result of their own or a close family member's interests (some examples are illustrated in the Commission's Code of Practice at Appendix B) and any political activity (form at Appendix A). Possible conflicts of interest may be tested at interview.

Terms and Conditions

You will be appointed by the Queen for a five-year non-renewable term of office.

Salary and time commitment

The First Commissioner is expected to work 2 days a week on average and will receive remuneration of £56,000.

Location

The majority of the Commission's work is done in central London, although travel within the UK is occasionally required.

Pension and redundancy

This is an office holder appointment and does not attract any benefits under any Civil Service Pension Scheme. You will not be eligible for redundancy pay as you are not an employee. No other arrangements have been made for compensation upon termination because an office holder who is appointed for a limited duration would have no expectation of serving beyond that period.

Status

You will share, with the other Commissioners and with the Commission's Chief Executive and Accounting Officer, a responsibility for the discharge of the functions laid on the Commission by the Constitutional Reform and Governance Act 2010. The authority delegated to you as the First Commissioner by the Commission Board will be set out in the Commission's Standing Orders. The work you carry out will be for you to determine in consultation with the rest of the Commission Board.

You will not become a member of the Civil Service. Commissioners are subject to the Civil Service Commission's Code of Practice for Commissioners, which sets out the role and responsibilities and standards of conduct they will observe while undertaking their business (see Appendix B).

Selection and Recruitment Process

This is an open competition and any suitably skilled and experienced individual may apply. In line with the statutory requirements, the First Commissioner is recruited on merit following a fair and open competition, following the principles set out in the Commission's *Recruitment Principles*, which apply to recruitment to the Civil Service <http://civilservicecommission.independent.gov.uk/wp-content/uploads/2015/05/RECRUITMENT-PRINCIPLES-FINAL.pdf>

The panel

The panel will be chaired by Sir Jeremy Heywood, Cabinet Secretary and Head of the Civil Service. Other panel members will be confirmed in due course.

Timetable

The deadline for receipt of applications is close of business 2nd December 2015.

It is envisaged that the interviews for shortlisted candidates will take place during w/c 14th December 2015. This post is subject to Parliamentary pre-appointment scrutiny. A hearing in front of the Public Administration and Constitutional Affairs Committee is likely to take place in January 2016.

How to apply

Applications should be in writing and should include the following:

- an up to date CV;
- a short (maximum two sides of A4) supporting statement, explaining how you meet the requirements of the role, set out in the ‘skills and experience required’ section above;
- a completed diversity and political activity form (see Appendix A) – this will be kept separate from your application and not considered by those making selection decisions but will be used to monitor the diversity of the applicant field;
- two referees, including contact details, whom will be contacted if you are invited for interview; and
- (if applicable) a statement of conflicts of interest – if you, your partner or dependents have any business interests or other activities that could be perceived as a conflict of interest with the work of the Commission, you should declare this when applying; further information on conflicts of interest is provided in the Code of Practice at Appendix B.

Applications should be sent to:

- By Email: proprietyandethicsteam@cabinetoffice.gov.uk
(preferred medium)
- By Post: Amy Bell, Propriety & Ethics Team, Cabinet Office, 70 Whitehall, London, SW1A 2AS

The deadline for receipt of applications is close of business, Wednesday 2nd December 2015.

Equality and Diversity

We are strongly committed to supporting the principle that everybody should have the same opportunities for employment, development and progression. This should be based on their ability, competence and suitability for the role. We value the wide range of skills and experience that come with recruiting Commissioners from a diverse range of career backgrounds and personal circumstances.

This means that no applicant should receive less favourable treatment on grounds of their ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, age, marital status, disability, religion, transgender status, family or domestic responsibilities. Candidates who have specific requirements should contact the Secretariat and we will do our best to accommodate any reasonable adjustments.

Contacts

For further information about the role or application process, including adjustments for applicants with disabilities or other requirements, in first instance please contact:

Amy Bell
Propriety & Ethics Team
Cabinet Office
70 Whitehall
London
SW1A 2AS
Amy.Bell@cabinetoffice.gov.uk
0207 276 2472

If you feel this competition has not been conducted fairly, openly and with selection decisions taken solely on merit and you wish to make a complaint, in line with the Recruitment Principles, you should in the first instance contact:

Helen Ewen
Propriety & Ethics Team
Cabinet Office
70 Whitehall
London
SW1A 2AS
Helen.Ewen@cabinetoffice.gov.uk

If you remain unsatisfied you do have the further opportunity to raise your complaint with the Civil Service Commission, using the contact details below:

Clare Salters (Chief Executive, Civil Service Commission)
Clare.Salters@csc.gov.uk

Appendix 3: CV Ian Watmore

Full time roles

- (1) Portfolio - 2012 to present:
 - Board member/HMG representative - Rugby World Cup 2015 - 2011 to Jan 2016.
 - Fundraising Committee - England Rugby's All Schools Initiative - 2012 to Mar 2016.
 - Board member – English Institute of Sport – 2002 to 2015
 - Church Commissioner - Church of England - 2014 to present
 - Chair/Trustee – Migraine Trust 2009 to present
 - Non-Executive Director - Information Commissioner's Office - 2013 to September 2016
 - Universities UK Efficiency Taskforce and Procurement UK - 2012 to 2015
 - University of Cambridge IT Supervisory Board - 2014 to present
 - Non-exec chair - Quantum Sports - a footballer and cricketer sports agency – 2014 - present, renewable annually
 - Project Board Altrincham Community Sports Hall - 2012 to 2015
- (2) Permanent Secretary - Cabinet Office - 2010 to 2012
- (3) Group Chief Executive – Football Association – 2009 to 2010
- (4) Permanent Secretary – Department for Innovation, Universities and Skills – 2007 to 2009
- (5) Permanent Secretary – Prime Minister's Delivery Unit – No 10 Downing Street 2006 - 2007
- (6) Director General and Government Chief Information Officer - Cabinet Office - 2004 to 2005
- (7) UK Managing Director - Accenture - 2000 to 2004
- (8) Partner - Andersen Consulting – 1990 to 2000
- (9) Information Technology/Management Consultant – Andersen Consulting – 1980 to 1990

Other roles/ career highlights

- (1) Honorary Doctorate – University of Westminster - 2009
- (2) Individual Winner Computing Industry's "Outstanding contribution to UK IT" award 2005
- (3) President Management Consultant's Association 2003/4

- (4) Board member/Chair e-Skills UK – 2001 to 2006
- (5) Parent Governor preparatory school – 2004 to 2006
- (6) Business in the Community – 2002 to 2004
- (7) Joint winner of two Smithsonian IT awards 1995, 2000 – UK Dept of Social Security and South African Independent Electoral Commission
- (8) Regular, high profile public speaking and media interviews with large public conferences and frequent specialist/national press, radio and TV appearances
- (9) Mathematics/Management Studies degree – Trinity College, Cambridge – 1977 to 1980

Formal Minutes

Tuesday 6 September 2016

Members present:

Bernard Jenkin, in the Chair

Ronnie Cowan

Mr Andrew Turner

Mrs Cheryl Gillan

Draft Report (*Appointment of the First Civil Service Commissioner*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

Ordered, That the draft Report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph.

Paragraphs 1 to 11 read and agreed to.

Resolved, That the Report be the Fourth Report of the Committee to the House.

Ordered, That the Chair make the Report to the House.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 14 September at 2.00pm.]

Witness

The following witness gave evidence. The transcript can be viewed on the [inquiry publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

Tuesday 6 September 2016

Question number

Ian Watmore, the Government's preferred candidate for First Civil Service Commissioner

[Q1-64](#)

List of Reports from the Committee during the current Parliament

All publications from the Committee are available on the [publications page](#) of the Committee's website.

The reference number of the Government's response to each Report is printed in brackets after the HC printing number.

Session 2015–16

First Report	Follow-up to PHSO Report: Dying without dignity	HC 432 (HC 770)
Second Report	Appointment of the UK's delegation to the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe	HC 658 (HC 962)
Third Report	The 2015 charity fundraising controversy: lessons for trustees, the Charity Commission, and regulators	HC 431 (HC 980)
Fourth Report	The collapse of Kids Company: lessons for charity trustees, professional firms, the Charity Commission, and Whitehall	HC 433 (HC 963)
Fifth Report	The Future of the Union, part one: English Votes for English laws	HC 523 (HC 961)
Sixth Report	Follow up to PHSO Report of an investigation into a complaint about HS2 Ltd	HC 793 (HC 258)
Seventh Report	Appointment of the Commissioner for Public Appointments	HC 869
Eight Report	The Strathclyde Review: Statutory Instruments and the power of the House of Lords	HC 752
Ninth Report	Democracy Denied: Appointment of the UK's delegation to the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe: Government Response to the Committee's Second Report of Session 2015–16	HC 962
First Special Report	Developing Civil Service Skills: a unified approach: Government Response to the Public Administration Select Committee's Fourth Report of Session 2014–15	HC 526
Second Special Report	Lessons for Civil Service impartiality for the Scottish independence referendum: Government Response to the Public Administration Select Committee's Fifth Report of Session 2014–15	HC 725
Third Special Report	Follow-up to PHSO Report: Dying without dignity: Government response to the Committee's First Report of Session 2015–16	HC 770

Fourth Special Report	The Future of the Union, part one: English Votes for English laws: Government response to the Committee's Fifth Report of Session 2015–16	HC 961
Fifth Special Report	The collapse of Kids Company: lessons for charity trustees, professional firms, the Charity Commission, and Whitehall: Government Response to the Committee's Fourth Report of Session 2015–16	HC 963
Sixth Special Report	The 2015 charity fundraising controversy: lessons for trustees, the Charity Commission, and regulators: Government response to the Committee's Third Report of Session 2015–16	HC 980

Session 2016–17

First Report	PHSO review: Quality of NHS complaints investigations	HC 94
Second Report	Appointment of the Chief Investigator of the Healthcare Safety Investigation Branch	HC 96
Third Report	Better Public Appointments?: The Grimstone Review on Public Appointments	HC 495
First Special Report	Follow up to PHSO Report of an investigation into a complaint about HS2 Ltd: Government and HS2 Ltd responses to the Committee's Sixth Report of Session 2015–16	HC 258